

Peer Review

Farid, Muhammad M. 2025. "The GREAT GAME Redux: Economic and Political Development Options for Pakistan." *Journal of High School Science* 9 (4): 47–72. <https://doi.org/10.64336/001c.146291>

Generally a good effort but needs more work. Please see comments below.

1. The manuscript presents content derived from the public domain. It therefore does not offer any unique perspective on the discussion. In this regard, I would like to semi-quantitate your discussion with a Pugh Matrix (see attached file). The table is self explanatory. You will need to assign weightage factors and scores and recalculate the numbers based on what you think should be the appropriate numbers (the numbers as input are mine and are meant purely to be used as a template). You can add more rows as necessary. Then, provide some perspective on the results from the Pugh table. This will provide a focused view of the manuscript objective; rather than just opinion and commentary.

2. Please thoroughly check the manuscript for factual errors. Khazakstan is not a NATO member.

3. References should be numbered sequentially in the manuscript in curved brackets. The reference section should be in APA format.

Desired outcomes	Weightage factor (1-10)	Pipeline (probability of achieving desired outcome, scored from 1-10)		
		IPI (score x weight)	CPEC (score x weight)	TAPI (score x weight)
Increased bargaining power for water release from India	7	8 x 7 = 56	3 x 7 = 21	3 x 7 = 21
Increases development of Balochistan	7	8 x 7 = 56	8 x 7 = 56	3 x 7 = 21
Decreases probability of war with India	6	8 x 6 = 48	3 x 6 = 18	7 x 6 = 42
Increases trade with China	4	4 x 4 = 16	7 x 4 = 28	5 x 4 = 20
Decreases cross-border terrorism and attacks from Taliban controlled Afghanistan, such as in the SWAT valley	3	3 x 3 = 9	3 x 3 = 9	8 x 3 = 24
Favorable loan terms or increased investment from China or the USA	5	3 x 5 = 15	8 x 5 = 40	7 x 5 = 35
Increases Middle-East Sunni governed countries funding/investment (due to non-participation in Shia-governed Iran IPI pipeline or US/Israel favored TAPI pipeline)	7	3 x 7 = 21	8 x 7 = 56	3 x 7 = 21
Increased power generation and distribution in Pakistan as opposed to only being used as transit of energy (gas or oil)	8	8 x 8 = 64	4 x 8 = 32	6 x 8 = 48
TOTAL	NA	285	260	232

Comment	Revised
The manuscript presents content derived from the public domain. It therefore does not offer any unique perspective on the discussion. In this regard, I would like to semi-quantitate your discussion with a Pugh Matrix (see attached file). The table is self explanatory. You will need to assign weightage factors and scores and recalculate the numbers based on what you think should be the appropriate numbers (the numbers as input are mine and are meant purely to be used as a template). You can add more rows as necessary. Then, provide some perspective on the results from the Pugh table. This will provide a focused view of the manuscript objective; rather than just opinion and commentary.	• Pugh Matrix table has been added to 2.8 Pakistan-Unique Opportunities (page 18) as below this table. • Description has been added to 2.8 Pakistan-Unique Opportunities, 2.8.1 Turkmenistan-Afghanistan-Pakistan-India (TAPI) Pipeline, 2.8.2 Iran-Pakistan India (IPI) Pipeline, 2.8.3. China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) (page 19-21) • From 18-21 pages, analysis and commentary has been slightly more elaborated and commented accordingly after the incorporation of the Pugh Matrix table.
Please thoroughly check the manuscript for factual errors. Khazakistan is not a NATO member.	Amended (page 17)
References should be numbered sequentially in the manuscript in curved brackets. The reference section should be in APA format.	• In-text citation has been revised as guided. • Reference list has been revised to APA format.

Thank you for addressing my comments. The manuscript is not formatted to the Journal's guidelines.

1. Please peruse review papers at our website. Your manuscript will need to confirm to the 'review paper' formatting style. This means you will need to remove the table of contents, the sections etc. and write using Introduction, Discussion, Perspectives and Conclusion as your heading with subheadings Italicized. Please number main heading as 1. 2.. 3.... etc, and subheadings as 1.1, 1.2, 1.3.... etc. Please DO NOT use the software's automatic numbering system to number headings, subheadings or references.

2. Please submit a word document with spacing of 1.15 lines, left and right margins of 1.0 inches and bottom and top margins of 0.5 inches. Do not indent. Start each paragraph (or subheading) with a blank line in between.

3. References must be in APA format. Ensure that books or book chapter references are in APA format. Please include a live link after each reference.

4. At least one row in your Pugh matrix is incorrect. Please color the weightage factors in red (wherever you have them included in the multiplication expression), these weightage factors must be the same for each row.

5. Please write in past perfect tense, third person (except where it does not make sense). Please pay attention to grammar, composition, syntax, and sentence structure.

6. Remove abbreviations. Instead spell out the full form in the first instance that abbreviation is encountered in the text.

Comment	Revised
Please peruse review papers at our website. Your manuscript will need to confirm to the 'review paper' formatting style. This means you will need to remove the table of contents, the sections etc. and write using Introduction, Discussion, Perspectives and Conclusion as your heading with subheadings Italicized. Please number main heading as 1. 2.. 3.... etc, and subheadings as 1.1, 1.2, 1.3.... etc. Please DO NOT use the software's automatic numbering system to number headings, subheadings or references.	Amended
Please submit a word document with spacing of 1.15 lines, left and right margins of 1.0 inches and bottom and top margins of 0.5 inches. Do not indent. Start each paragraph (or subheading) with a blank line in between.	Amended
References must be in APA format. Ensure that books or book chapter references are in APA format. Please include a live link after each reference.	Reference list has been revised to APA format with live link
At least one row in your Pugh matrix is incorrect. Please color the weightage factors in red (where ever you have them included in the multiplication expression), these weightage factors must be the same for each row.	Pugh Matrix amended (page 13-14)
Please write in past perfect tense, third person (except where it does not make sense). Please pay attention to grammar, composition, syntax, and sentence structure.	Amended

Remove abbreviations. Instead spell out the full form in the first instance that abbreviation is encountered in the text.	Removed or full name has given.
---	---------------------------------

Thank you for addressing my comments. Accepted.

However, please address the highlighted sections in the attached doc and return file after corrections have been made. Copyediting cannot begin unless we receive the corrections.